

Contact: Jonathan Goodwill

Ref: DA0014/17

16 March 2018

KOPWA Ltd
C/ Smyth Planning
Lv4,S 67, 330 Wattle Street
ULTIMO NSW 2007

Dear Meg

Application No.:	DA0014/17
Proposed development:	Demolish existing structures and staged construction of a residential aged care facility comprising 102 beds, basement car parking and associated landscaping works - State Environmental Planning Policy (Housing for Seniors or People with a Disability) 2004 - heritage conservation area
Property:	12, 14 & 16 Trafalgar Avenue ROSEVILLE NSW 2069

We have undertaken an assessment of your amended application. The amended application has not adequately responded to the issues identified in the previous assessment letter. The following issues are required to be addressed:

1. Heritage

Council's Heritage Advisor has provided the following comments:

The amended design is only a slight improvement on the previous scheme and key concerns remain. The development type, and its resulting building scale and form as well as the landscape setting, is incompatible with the character of the conservation area. However, there are a number of improvements that could be made to the scheme to make it less intrusive, such as setting the building further away from the side boundary shared with No. 8 Trafalgar Avenue, having a more sympathetic colour scheme, relocating the kiosk substation, etc.

The proposed aged care facility would have an adverse impact on the heritage values of The Grove HCA, as well as the heritage values of heritage items and HCAs

in its vicinity. The proposal does not meet the requirements of Ku-ring-gai Local Environmental Plan (Local Centres) 2012 nor of Ku-ring-gai Local Centres Development Control Plan. In addition, the proposal does not meet the requirements of Clause 33 of State Environmental Planning Policy (Housing for Seniors or People with a Disability) 2004.

The proposed development is not appropriate for The Grove HCA due to its unacceptably adverse impact on the aesthetic and historic values of the HCA as well as the adverse impact on the heritage items and HCA in the vicinity of the subject site. The application is therefore recommended for refusal or substantial re-design.

Any redesign should consider retaining the existing landform, retaining the existing house at no. 12 Trafalgar Avenue, having two new "houses" on the site of no. 16 Trafalgar Avenue (in -line with the existing setbacks), relocating the entry courtyard behind the "houses", and locating the majority of the development behind these "houses".

In addition:

- The external wall of Fire Stair 1 and the adjacent Sitting area is to be set back a further 3 metres in order to not intersect with that part of the external wall of the duplex building that bounds the main stair of the entry hall.*
- The kiosk substation is to be located on the north-western side of the entry courtyard of the proposed complex.*
- A revised colour scheme is to be provided for approval by Council's Heritage Officers.*
- A revised landscaping scheme is to be provided.*
- New development (including the driveway) is to be set back a minimum of 6 metres from the south-eastern boundary in order to provide a landscape buffer to the HCA.*

2. Neighbourhood character

The proposal include a pitched roof above Rooms 32 and 33, a planted flat roof above Room 9 and a planted flat roof above the driveway. The transition relies on planting above structures to link the roof forms to the neighbouring dwelling at No. 8 Trafalgar Avenue. However, the flat roof above Room 9 seems out of character with both the development and the architectural character of No. 8 Trafalgar Avenue.

It is recommended that the planted terrace above the basement driveway area be retained and the roof above Room 9 be changed to an extension of the pitched roof of Room 33 to cover Room 9 as well (i.e. as an interpretation of the unsymmetrical roof line of the contributory item No. 14) or provide a separate pitched roof above Room 9.

3. Landscaping

Screen planting to south-eastern boundary

The driveway to the basement parking area has been relocated a minimum distance of 2 metres from the south eastern boundary however the path has also been relocated to the south-eastern side of the driveway resulting in no additional landscape space along the side setback.

The garden bed along the south eastern boundary ranges in width from 1435mm at the front boundary to 650mm adjacent to Tree 74. The narrow garden bed is insufficient to minimise impacts of the proposed development on the streetscape character and provide an appropriately scale landscape buffer to the adjoining property No. 8 Trafalgar Avenue. Council's Heritage Advisor has recommended a minimum setback of 6m from the south-eastern side boundary.

Front setback - 14 Trafalgar Avenue

The proposed replacement of the existing landscaping, changes to soil levels and the construction of a raised garden bed in front of the building are not characteristic of the HCA. The existing brick fence, sandstone edging, planting and levels are to be retained. Some of the existing vegetation can be removed to create a lawn area.

Front setback – 12 and 16 Trafalgar Avenue

In general the proposed species selection is acceptable however planting out the entire front setback is not in character with the streetscape particularly in a HCA where most frontage gardens have lawn areas. Some of the planting is to be deleted and replaced with lawn.

Tree replenishment

In accordance with the previous comments an additional 12 trees were required to be planted. Numerous trees are proposed to be planted however only six (6) of the proposed species will attain a height of 13 metres. These trees are; 1 x *Angophora costata* (Sydney Red Gum), 1 x *Angophora floribunda* (Rough barked Apple), 1 x

Eucalyptus piperita (Sydney Peppermint), 1 x *Eucalyptus racemosa* (Large Scribbly Gum) and 1 x *Jacaranda mimosifolia* (Jacaranda).

- An additional six (6) trees that attain a height 13 metres are required to be planted on the site.
- At least four (4) of these trees are to be planted along the south western boundary
- To provide additional deep soil area for canopy tree planting the rectangular section of paving with water feature adjacent to the south western boundary is to be deleted and the retaining walls relocated a minimum distance of 6 metres from the boundary.
- One (1) of the trees is to be planted at the south eastern end of the rectangular lawn area in Courtyard 2
- *Eucalyptus piperita* (Sydney Peppermint) and *Eucalyptus racemosa* (Large Scribbly Gum) are to be replaced with species characteristic of Sydney Blue Gum High Forest

Podium planting

- There is insufficient information on the depth of the proposed podium and roof top planting areas.
- There is insufficient information on the depth of soil above the pump room.
- Details of access point for the maintenance of the rooftop planting on the ground floor adjacent to bedrooms 9 & 10 and level 1 adjacent to bedroom 33

Screen planting

The screen planting proposed for the south western boundary is appropriate however a greater variety of species is required particularly adjacent to the adjoining heritage items. Excessive use of mono-cultural plantings in a HCA is to be avoided.

Staging

The landscape works are to be carried out in accordance with the proposed staging of the development. The plans are to be amended to include the landscape works to be carried out at each stage.

We believe that the above issues may be resolved through the provision of additional information and amended plans. Should you choose to amend your

application, you please provide us with three (3) sets of plans and written particulars identifying the changes made to the original application.

The submission of amended plans will result in an additional assessment and administrative fee (40% of the statutory DA fee) being \$18,332. This fee must be paid at the time amended plans are lodged. If any of the required information and/or fees are not provided, the amended plans will not be accepted.

Please provide us with the amended plans and additional information within 28 days of the date of this letter.

Should you have any further enquiries I can be contacted on 9424 0740.

Regards

Jonathan Goodwill
Executive Assessment Officer